

**MINUTES**  
**ENOCH CITY COUNCIL**  
**January 18, 2017 at 6:00pm**  
**City Council Chambers**  
**City Offices, 900 E. Midvalley Road**

**Members present:**

Mayor Geoffrey Chesnut  
Council Member David Harris  
Council Member Steve Johnson  
Council Member Jolene Lee  
Council Member Dave Owens  
Council Member Shawn Stoor

**Staff present:**

Julie Watson, Recorder  
Ashley Horton, Treasurer  
Todd Sheeran, City Atty.  
Robert Dotson, City Mgr.  
Jackson Ames, PD Chief  
Earl Gibson, Public Works

**Public present:** Michelle Pritchard, Dilworth Armstrong, Jim Watson, Ryan Dalebout, Celesta Lyman, Bob Tingey and Justin Gray

1. **CALL TO ORDER OF REGULAR COUNCIL MEETING-**By Mayor Chesnut at 6:00pm. He welcomed the audience.
  - a. **Pledge of Allegiance-**Led by City Manager Dotson
  - b. **Invocation-**Audience invited to participate-Given by Council Member Harris
  - c. **Inspirational thought-**Given by Council Member Stoor
  - d. **Approval of Agenda for January 18, 2017- Council Member Harris made a motion to approve the agenda. Motion was by seconded by Council Member Stoor and all voted in favor.**
  - e. **Approval of Minutes for January 4, 2017-Council Member Harris made a motion to approve the minutes. Motion was seconded by Council Member Johnson and all voted in favor.**
  - f. **Conflict of Interest Declaration for this agenda-**none stated
  
2. **APPOINT NEW MEMBER TO THE TREE COMMITTEE**

Mayor Chesnut said we received an application from Mark E. Howard who is interested in serving the community on the Tree Committee. **Council Member Stoor made a motion to approve Mark Howard to serve on the Tree Committee. Motion was seconded by Council Member Harris and all voted in favor.**
  
3. **PRESENTATION FROM REC ADVISORY COMMITTEE-Celesta Lyman**

Celesta Lyman came forward to give a presentation on the Recreation Advisory Board saying they have been formed for 11 years and want to make a report. She said former Council member Justin Gray saw that there may be an interest in a Rec Center in Enoch and several people volunteered to serve to help make that happen. They needed a site and had the opportunity to do something with City owned land by the water tanks. She told about the committee and that there have been several Eagle projects (10) that have really helped to add the amenities and she told about the projects. One was the kiosk with the intent to recognize those who have volunteered to build the Rec Complex and also the 60 businesses that contributed and saw the worth of this complex. She also thanked the City for the land and the City Staff for taking care of current maintenance needs noting Shelly Boebert has been especially involved. She called attention to the panels displayed around the room saying they will be attached to the kiosk. She said she hopes to continue to partner with the City and move forward with a pavilion, playground and walking path. She wanted to say thanks to Justin and to all who have worked many hours.

This is a monument to our City and those who wanted good things for their families. Mayor Chesnut asked what is coming in the future. Celesta said the next big project needs a “driver” to get it started but could be the pavilion. Council Member Stoor thanked the Committee saying he did not realize how much work this has been. This is for the good of the whole community and it shows we as a City care enough to provide this center. That makes a community great. Council Member Lee added they prepared a press release for the local newspapers because this story deserves the press. We know this is what our resident’s value, Celesta added. There was applause from audience and Mayor Chesnut thanked Celesta and the others who worked so hard to show things are happening in our community.

**4. PRESENTATION ON DISC GOLF AND TRAILS-Council Member Lee**

Mayor Chesnut asked Council Member Lee to tell the Council about this. She said last June the Council approved a budget that included \$5000 for the disc golf program and \$2000 for trails as her assignments. An “ad hoc” trails committee was put together to look at goals and plans. Twelve people in the community were interested in this. They discovered Enoch has ten green spaces or parks developed and/or planned. Most are neighborhood parks. Enoch has a natural dividing line in Minersville Highway and we would like to help bridge that divide. The committee believes Enoch is proud of our history including the Old Spanish Trail. That and other things are getting lost. Many do not even know who started this community. They looked to the City’s vision statement for guidance and they found it. The trail system will be worked into the green spaces and the disc golf program will be an incentive to move from space to space. They will develop trails involving historical points with signage, benches and other amenities as funds allow. We are starting with disc golf.

She introduced Ryan Dalebout, a student at SUU who is working as an intern to help implement the disc golf program. Ryan said they work with rural communities to develop programs like this. He gave a power point presentation to explain disc golf saying basically this is golf with discs. The City logo is on the discs and he explained the three types likening them to different golf clubs. The objection is to traverse a course with the fewest throws of the disc. The rules are simple and similar to golf. He explained that the one with the least points wins. We are placing the cages in four of the parks; three in each. There will be some method to check out the discs. Council Member Lee has a pamphlet with rules that is in the works. Schools will help with the learning process as he gives presentations to them and he gave the schedule for that.

Council Member Stoor said this can be seriously competitive. This is really a new and emerging sport and almost anyone can participate. Council Member Lee said what you spend on the discs is not too relevant. The expertise comes in the throw. This can be played with any age group and is a really good time as well as being an inexpensive sport to get started with. Also there is virtually no maintenance after installation. We have 12 cages and 120 discs in our possession now. They will take it to the schools to get the kids interested and bring the parents along in the game. She passed out a copy of the brochure with the rules. Ryan told more about how he will present to the schools with the help of volunteers. Council Member Lee said she got t-shirts for the interns to identify them at the schools. Ryan gave more details about how the kids will help teach after they learn the sport. The City logo is on the discs and pencils and all within budget. On the second Saturday in May there will be a display of the game by Cam Findlay. The Iron County Tourism Bureau will pay for the brochures and are really interested in us being on the map with this activity because it is something for tourist to do also.

She told about the items in the brochure showing the locations of the cages in the parks and more details. This will be part of initial system of trails to link the parks. She gave more details of the planning of this and told about some sites for the historical part of the trail system as well as many more details of what is planned. She asked for questions. Council Member Johnson asked about checking discs out. Council Member Lee said we are trying to come up with some

system to check them out from the City Office. They are still working out details of how that will work for a check out system. Having fun is the goal and bringing people together. Mayor Chesnut thanked her for the efforts on this.

**5. PUBLIC HEARING ON CHANGE TO CODE OF REVISED ORDINANCES, CHAPTER 14-100, WATER**

**Council Member Harris made a motion to close the regular meeting and enter the public hearing regarding changes to the Code of Revised Ordinances, Chapter 14-100, water. Motion was seconded by Council Member Stoor and all voted in favor.**

Mayor Chesnut asked City Manager Dotson to explain this change. He said we originally had set 1944 as the cut-off date for accepting water rights. Now that we have more information we set the priority date for water rights to be given to City at 1934 in the Subdivision Ordinance and now need to change it in the Code. More accurate information was given for this date. This protects the City so we will have valid water right dates when developers or others want to develop. The only change is the date. Mayor Chesnut invited public comments.

Jim Watson asked how many water rights the City owns. *City Manager Dotson said we have 1348 and we would lose about 20% of the existing rights we have with the change to 1934.* There were no other comments.

**Council Member Harris made a motion to close the public hearing and return to the regular meeting. Motion was seconded by Council Member Owens and all voted in favor.**

**6. ORDINANCE NO. 2017-01-18-A AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE ENOCH CITY CODE OF REVISED ORDINANCES, TITLE 14-000. UTILITIES, CHAPTER 14-100. WATER**

City Manager Dotson gave more details about the State Engineer, the Groundwater Management Plan and the safe yield. Currently we are taking more than is recharged. Mayor Chesnut explained the recharge and how rights have been allocated saying we draw down faster than it recharges if newer rights are allowed to be pumped. The goal is to stop using more water than has been allocated since 1934. Dilworth added in the law it states that if the State Engineer sets a more firm date later based on better information we will go with that date.

There was more discussion and questions about the Groundwater Management Plan, farm use and court action to disallow water rights. As a community we want to make a plan to be at a safe yield forever. There is a combination of all kinds of ideas. In the past, the safe yield was not known so rights were created until 1964. That stopped as it was discovered there is not that much water. There would be a serious imbalance if all were pumped. Dilworth said surface water out of Coal Creek covers part of the valley. By middle of June that water is gone. There used to be seven irrigation companies and now there are only four. There are different types of rights to use that water. In the past they were allowed to use supplemental underground water from wells too. When sprinkler lines came into wide use they pumped more water out of wells than they used from Coal Creek which helped cause the aquifer drawdown. Mayor Chesnut said this explains why we do not have enough water now. Council Member Lee clarified that we do not want to take newer water rights than 1934 to protect the water rights we have now so we can provide for residents. Council Member Johnson added we are protecting the City from useless rights.

Mayor Chesnut asked for a motion. **Council Member Harris made motion to approve Ordinance No. 2017-01-18-A, an ordinance amending the Enoch City Code of Revised Ordinances, Title 14-000. Utilities. Motion was seconded by Council Member Stoor and a roll call vote was held as follows:**

**Council Member Harris-Yes  
Council Member Johnson-Yes  
Council Member Lee-Yes**

**Council Member Stoor-yes  
Council Member Owens-Yes  
Motion passed**

**7. DISCUSS CHANGES TO M-R-2 ZONE**

Mayor Chesnut asked Council Member Harris to lead off on this discussion. Council Member Harris said this has been the subject of the last several Planning Commission meetings. We have had the M-R-2 zone for a long time. This zone allows for multi-family homes like duplexes, twin homes and town homes. He explained that in this zone two homes can be on a 22,000 sf lot. Also permitted are single family dwellings on that lot size. Some people thought this was a “work around” of the smaller lots, i.e. a loophole or an “end run” around the larger lot size and the referendum against the smaller lots. This was always the zone that allowed for this type of homes to be built. The Planning Commission felt that when a developer came in and did a zone change to M-R-2 to build on smaller lots they thought there were some issues to clean up in the wording of this zone. He referred to the changes in the packet. He clarified the definitions as added. Essentially this lowers the density from how it was written originally. Not all were onboard with this but felt it was necessary to stop other problems from coming due to the current wording. He added we plan to look at an R-1-11 zone that was suggested during the M-R-2 public hearings.

Council Member Johnson said in reading the minutes from the Planning Commission it sounded like about half were fine with looking at R-1-11 and the others still see it as an “end run” around the smaller lot size from the referendum. R-1-11 is a more straightforward way to permit this and is not meant to get anything over on anyone. When smaller lots were voted against we had this zone on the books already. Mayor Chesnut said we would be creating additional legislation to add an R-1-11 zone. This zone already allows for this SFR on a smaller lot. Council Member Harris said there is demand for smaller lots these days. Some think the rural atmosphere would be compromised by smaller lots. People currently living on half acre lots would not be allowed to split their lots. This would be a zone in an area all to itself. We as a City Council can decide where this would be appropriate. Again definitions and language were clarified.

Mayor Chesnut said some don't want this zone at all. Council Member Harris said the intent was considered and this will be revisited again in the future. What is here now makes the MR-2 zone clearer on what you can do and is an improvement to the current language. Council Member Johnson said much was discussed about the definition of townhomes being vague. It seems clear to him. Referring to density however 14-5 should not be plural. City manager Dotson said that was scratched out and got missed in the printed text changes. There was more discussion of the terms and definitions. Council Member Harris said the intent of townhomes was not clear. A townhome is for two families. This was heavily discussed and can be two owners or an HOA to regulate the lot. As a City we don't want to regulate the nature of the ownership. A townhome has two separate owners. A duplex has one owner. We are limiting it to two homes on a lot. Council Member Harris said the density shall not exceed two townhomes, one twin home or duplex per 22,000sf lot which keeps the density the same. Council Member Harris said he thinks the changes are fine as written for now. There was brief discussion of other items such as group homes which will be addressed by the Planning Commission next and will come as changes to all zones when decided. Council Member Harris said we are being consistent with State and Federal laws. There was more discussion of who regulates what on homes and decided that more changes could be made when we clean up the group home language later. City Manager Dotson said he would make the changes to the text as discussed.

**8. ORDINANCE NO. 2017-01-18-B AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE ENOCH ZONING ORDINANCE, CHAPTER 14, MULTIPLE RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT, M-R-2**

Mayor Chesnut asked for a motion. **Council Member Harris made a motion to approve Ordinance No. 2017-01-18-B, an ordinance amending the Enoch Zoning**

**Ordinance, Chapter 14, Multiple Residential District, M-R-2 with changes as discussed.  
Council Member Johnson seconded the motion and a roll call vote was held as follows:**

**Council Member Harris-Yes**

**Council Member Stoor-yes**

**Council Member Johnson-Yes**

**Council Member Owens-Yes**

**Council Member Lee-Yes**

**Motion passed**

**9. DISCUSSION OF EMPLOYEE WAGES-Council Member Stoor**

Mayor Chesnut called on Council Member Stoor who brought this up initially. Council Member Stoor said this came up because of the revolving door of employees leaving and why that happens. There was a committee for wages in the budget talks. Dan did extensive work on comparing cities and job descriptions. What we found is in most cases our employees are grossly underpaid in almost every category compared to others in the State. As a result that committee decided to rectify that with raises in a plan to get closer to the average pay. That was instituted to get to half way of the goal they set in the first year and next year the rest of the raise would be given. He and Council Member Owens looked at studies but want to put into place something more permanent to ideally get to the study average. He would like to include a more regional study because we seem to be losing employees to others in the area. His proposal is in the course of the next four years we bring wages up to the study average and include a COLA. We should keep it a “live document” of how we come up with the findings and incorporate a pay range for new hires. They grow in pay as they improve skills. Council Member Owens said one thing they talked about is how we decide what a certain job is worth monetarily to figure a job pay range based on regional demographics. Cities grow and most employees wear many hats. We have an opportunity here for a family mentality. We don’t want anyone to be stagnant in their job. With a pay range we have something to base the wages on for merit. The target pay will go forward for next year with no COLA but we should not leave it there. We should keep it organic and update the study with a focus on regional area wages. That is the proposal Council Member Stoor said.

Council Member Johnson gave feedback saying he thinks since the goal is to pay the average of a wage per the study and it is important to put that in perspective. He recalls that it is important to consider all the facts for residents. An excellent staff wants to serve fairly and in history the City Council decided it was necessary to increase the property tax to cover expenses and one was wage increases. The people of Enoch overturned that decision by referendum. Things were going well until someone circulated wage information from local governments. One person even offered to sell that information. The county paid the price however our staff convinced him to share the data. What we got was incongruous because jobs were not identical city to city. It was apples to oranges with our staff being the ones who stood to gain by creating fair comparisons. As discussed it was found we had a large surplus of \$59,000. After we decided to do the wage increase we found we did not have that surplus after all. We should not be comparing ourselves to a limited group of employees in other governments. We should be compared to those working in Enoch. We want to represent them in choosing for Enoch and our employees. As citizens of Enoch do our employees deserve more than the rest of the people of Enoch. Does government service make them more valuable? Are they the only ones who receive training? Do they get higher pay by earning advanced degrees? Sometimes that is justified due to the cost of education. Many Enoch residents are self-employed or work at part time jobs. He went on that all expenses are born by those making less. Referring to the Utah “right to know” website he mentioned wage information on the site and he was told it is accurate. However the information was voluntary or obtained through GRAMA requests. How does this impact us? Our employees are too valuable to lose and experience makes them valuable. Susan left and Dan came and then we got Ashley and had to agonize over that choice. It was a difficult decision and we had great candidates. He said he does not see that finding quality replacements is a problem. What has experience shown us? Susan left for SUU and then came back and left again. It is a

mixed message. Dan is an experienced entrepreneur and he left us for County government. Not one has gone to the private sector because government jobs are more secure. Why are government employees paid more? We should compare wages to a limited group. Alma Adams conducted the wage study in question. It was a racket by him and he did this to get paid for it. Wages will never stop spiraling for government employees. More employees will leave and we will never be able to approach the wages recommended from the study. We should warn other governing bodies of this conspiracy as we knowingly participated. There is a policy in place. It is easy to be generous with others money. Instead of wage increases we should offer a bonus to be gotten from voluntary contributions by residents. That will show the will of the people. He says let people improve their lot as they may. People will always change jobs. Do what is right for Enoch.

Mayor Chesnut thanked Council Member Johnson and asked if he willing to concede if we come to an average wage of Enoch residents as a basis for employees. Would he be willing to accept that figure? Mayor Chesnut said the average income in Enoch is \$53,000 which is higher than Cedar City. He asked again if Council Member Johnson is willing to say we will give raises based on that target point. Mayor Chesnut recapped saying Council Member Johnson said he wants to compare residents to our employees. Mayor Chesnut said self-reporting is notoriously inaccurate. With the propensity for inaccuracy isn't it safe to assume we should not rely on these numbers. Dan did not say our information is inaccurate but we have to take it with a grain of salt due to self-reporting. Employees are not expendable but we expend a bunch of money to hire and train and the constant turnover is bad. It behooves us as stewards of the people's money to find a mechanism to lower the expenditure on employees. A small raise might make a difference. It is cheaper to keep employees than hire new staff repeatedly and that should be a principle to adhere to. As for government employees being paid more, that may be true at the federal level but not local government. Mayor Chesnut said if we were not at the very bottom we were next to the bottom on the wage scale. As far as Alma Adams and a conspiracy more than one person was pushing this. It is not a conspiracy but a good business strategy. Mayor Chesnut said he would be shocked in rural southern Utah that there is a conspiracy to drive up government expenditures. The voluntary pay bonus suggested is trumped out by those not able to have the tough conversation. When he hears that it is important to consider, he believes that people who use that argument are weak people who will not have the tough conversation. It is an easy cop out. There was more discussion on origin of government taxes due to the selfish drive of those who are unwilling to pay for services from the City. Difficult as this is we have employees with families to support and if we are unwilling to compensate them fairly we are not comparing by the same things. The voluntary contribution was silly as a final thought. It is the proper role of government to pay their employees fairly. Mayor Chesnut said people expect things from government; health, safety, services of water, sewer and garbage collection and that costs money. Whatever the market will bear is what private government should do too. Outsourcing does not work well. We need to be more long term. He is fine with the principle of buying into the spiral but to say simply that we shouldn't be truthful about what it costs to support a family in Iron County then that should be a point of concern. He added he has no has problem with pursuing a local option or regional study of who we lost employees to. He appreciates some of Council Member Johnsons concessions and it was a healthy discussion. Council Member Stoor added he appreciates the discussion as well adding a parting comment that with the revolving door we have an obligation to employees to pay them fairly. We are effectively asking them to work for 20% less than the going rate. We will have turnover but we should slow the pace with a wage increase.

Mayor Chesnut suggested we could institute another working group to delve into this. It could be a group that would rotate so all are involved in the discussions. Council Member Stoor said that is part of his suggestion. Inflation in itself is a factor also. Mayor Chesnut said he would discuss this with City Manager Dotson about the ad hoc committee. There was no other action tonight.

**10. PUBLIC COMMENTS-**

Justin Gray said regarding the comments on wages, your employees are the strength of a business or city. If you don't pay well you will lose them. You can't afford to keep training new people because it costs much more in the long run. He said a few years ago the City Council was going to raise taxes and due to some misrepresentation by some City Council members who are no longer here it got beat down due to that misrepresentation by those against it. He is not for tax increases but is for keeping up Enoch City. For fourteen years he was on the City Council with four years as Mayor. They worked hard to keep the City going well and to keep budget where it is but the point comes when you have to get more. Approach it in a way that is clear and for what Enoch gets out the property tax. He added one more thing, about five years ago he signed a letter of complaint against an individual who is living in boxes and trailers on a lot on Heather Hue Road and there has been nothing done about it since then. He is wondering what can be done about that adding City Manager Dotson knows about it. This should be cleared up because they are living there with no water or sewer adding they are not there all the time.

**11. COUNCIL/STAFF REPORT**

Earl Gibson reported there is snow forecast for tonight and they are ready for it. The crew is working at the shop on equipment and clean-up. They are also grading dirt roads.

Dilworth Armstrong thanked the Council for passing the water ordinance.

Julie Watson reported this is an election year for the Mayor's seat and two City Council seats.

Council Member Owens reported the EDC will meet tomorrow.

**12. ADJOURN- Council Member Harris made motion to adjourn. Motion was seconded by Council member Owens and all voted in favor.** The meeting ended at 8:17pm.

Julie Watson 2-1-17  
Julie Watson, Recorder Date